

# Logia et Agrapha Domini Jesu

## Part One

Anthony Alcock

Between 1919 and 1924 Michael Asin et Palacios (Latin form)/Miguel Asin y Palacios (Spanish form) published texts culled from several Muslim writers who had clearly engaged with Christianity and published them in *Patrologia Orientalis* 13 (1919) pp. 327-431 (fascicule 1) and 19 (1924) pp. 545-624 (fascicule 2). Prof. Asin y Palacios was a prolific writer on Islamic studies and championed the idea that there was Islamic influence to be found in the *Divina Commedia* of Dante. The full title of his articles is "Logia et agrapha Domini Jesu apud Moslemicos scriptores, asceticos praesertim, usitata" (Sayings and unwritten utterances of the Lord Jesus used among Muslim writers, especially ascetics). The translations merely skim the surface of the enormous scholarship of Asin's work, but it is hoped that they will make the substance of his work more easily available to a wider readership.

Each passage of text in Asin's work is followed by the Gospel reference, if any, and detailed notes indicating how this passage has been treated in the various sources. I have tried to simplify this information as accurately as possible. All of the 102 texts in fascicule 1 have been taken from the monumental work of al-Ghazâli *Revival of Religious Disciplines* (*Ihya' 'Ulûm al Dîn* احياء علوم الدين), abbreviated here as **Ih**. The remaining 122 texts have been gathered together from the sources provided in the *Conspectus Siglorum* on pp. 343-347 (of fasc. 1) and are published in fascicule 2.

In his preface<sup>1</sup> Asin writes that while studying the works of Islamic ascetics he came upon words and deeds (*dicta et facta*) of Jesus recorded in them which were either not in or quite different from the text in the canonical gospels. Most of them come

---

<sup>1</sup> In this section I have tried to summarize the words and opinions of Asin

from works written in the 10<sup>th</sup> or 11<sup>th</sup> cent. AD. Despite their lateness, they have been transmitted from sources dating back to the 1st cent. AH. The claims made by Barthélemy d' Herbelot, a 17th cent. orientalist, in an article entitled "Engil" (Gospel) in his great work usually known by the short title *Bibliothèque Orientale*, that Muslim scholars always added a 'new turn' (*nouveau tour*) to whatever they found in the Gospels are dismissed by Asin.<sup>2</sup>

As Muslims the writers of these texts are of course unable to accept the divinity of Jesus but are easily able to accept everything else about the moral probity of Christianity, and there is no reason to suppose that the *logia* are not genuine, even if part of a tradition that may not be entirely error-free (*ab omni erroris macula pura*).<sup>3</sup> The plain style and the openness of the narration are traits that point to an oral tradition widespread in oriental christianity. Oral tradition was an important part of the transmission of Islam, until at least the second cent. AH. Islam has received much of Christian revelation. Even pre-Islamic Arabs were not all idolaters or atheists, but many were familiar with Judaism and Christianity, especially Nestorianism.<sup>4</sup> Besides Nau other European scholars have drawn attention to the Christian influence of morality, in particular asceticism, on Islam, and the principal works are cited in a footnote on p. 337. Muhammad himself was not well disposed to the Christian ascetic life, but in the early stages of Islam *aliqui, et non quidem pauci, visi sunt homines pii et devoti, qui, praetermissa tali mahometica interdictione, ad ritualia religionis moslemicae praecepta quasdam alias spirituales ut aiunt exercitationes jungebant* (some and not a few ... pious and devoted men, who, ignoring the interdiction of Muhammad, added certain other spiritual exercises, as they say, to the ritual precepts of Islam): among the examples of these 'exercises' are supererogatory prayers, fasts and nocturnal vigils, celibacy, pilgrimage and the eremitical life. From the second cent. AH the eremitical life became the cenobitic life, and this developed among both men and women.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>2</sup> One can only suppose that this great authority had remained unchallenged because there was no other authority competent enough to dismiss it.

<sup>3</sup> In a footnote on p.336 Asin quotes a conversation between 'Umar ibn al-Khattab and Muhammad to demonstrate that Muslim writers were in fact using Christian texts, which draws an angry response from Muhammad to the effect that Jewish and Christian sources have been superseded and even Moses himself, if still alive, would follow the word of God as transmitted through himself.

<sup>4</sup> See for example François Nau *L'expansionisme nestorienne en Asie* (1914)

<sup>5</sup> Cf. I. Goldhizer 'Asketismus und Sufismus' in *Vorlesungen über den Islam* (1910) and D.B. MacDonald *Development of Muslim theology, jurisprudence and constitutional theory* (1903) pp. 173-184.

This is the largest collection of these texts published to date.<sup>6</sup> It is by no means the result of an exhaustive study, merely the fruit of what has been read *subito et improviso casu* (by sudden and unforeseen chance), but this reading includes the four volumes of al Ghazâli which, as Asin freely admits, *absolute exspoliavi* (I plundered thoroughly). Works of Arab historians, such as Tabari, have not been taken into account, largely because what they have written about Jesus follows what is in the Koran.

The texts contain material relating not only to Jesus but also Zachary and the Virgin Mary. The order followed is largely chronological, but al Ghazâli's work has been given precedence, and indeed excerpts from this work form the first fascicule of the present work. The editorial procedure is explained together with the difficulties of thoroughly examining the language of the texts

I have followed the Latin translation, but occasionally have remained closer to the Arabic text. Reference is made throughout to a commentary on al Ghazâli's work by Sayyid Murtadha al Zabidi (18th cent.), abbreviated to IT in the text, and the work of Abu Tâlib al Makki (10th cent.), abbreviated to Q. Reference is made after some sayings to Ibn Abu'l Dunya, a 9<sup>th</sup> cent. lexicographical writer, who has also preserved some of these sayings as well as *hadith*.

A note on nomenclature. On the principle that all (European, at least) languages have their own form of what used to be known in English as Christian names have been left in the form familiar to native English speakers. Arabic names are more of a problem, largely because the only proper way to write them is to use Arabic script. Anything else is an approximation.

---

<sup>6</sup> Works containing such texts: E. Preuschen *Antilegomena* (1904), B. Pick *Paralipomena* (1908), S. Zwemer *The Moslem Christ* (1912). A work that Asin was not able to cite is that published by James Robson *Christ in Islam* (1929), who has organized some of the sayings in Asin's article and some published by David Margoliouth in the *Expository Times* thematically.

**1. Ih. I, 7, 8 inf.**

Jesus<sup>7</sup> said: *He who knows, does and teaches, this one will be called great in the kingdom of heaven.*

Matth. 5, 19. Also attributed to Muhammad

**2. Ih. I, 24, 5**

Jesus said: *How many trees there are ! But not all bear fruit. How many fruits there are ! But not all are good. How many disciplines there are ! But not all are useful.*

Matth. 7,16-20. Not literally, but according to sense.

**3. Ih. I, 27 4 inf.**

Jesus said: *Do not expose wisdom before the eyes of the unworthy, for you will ill-treat it. Do not keep the worthy from it. Be like a kind doctor who applies medicine to the place of sickness. He who who offers wisdom to the unworthy is ignorant. And he who keeps the worthy from it is unjust. Wisdom has its own right and its own family which is worthy of it. Everyone worthy of right, give it to him.*

Asin breaks the saying into various parts and relates them to texts found in other Muslim writers. See 1 Cor.. 1,6 and 2, 1ff.

**4. Ih. I, 43, 4. inf.**

Jesus said: *Do not hang pearls on the necks of swine. Wisdom is greater than a pearl, and he who scorns is worse than the swine.*

Matth. 7, 6. The word 'hang' seems to be a miswriting for another Arabic word, which I cannot read but which is not the same word as in the Arabic NT.

**5. Ih. I, 45, 14, inf.**

Jesus said: *The wicked scholars are like a stone that has fallen over the mouth of the river: it neither drinks the water nor allows it to flow into the field that has*

---

<sup>7</sup> The name of Jesus is followed by variant phrases similar to that used after the name of Muhammad regularly by the devout and less regularly by the less devout *صلي الله عليه وسلم*

*been sown. They are also like a the pipe of a latrine whose outside is white gypsum but whose inside is fetid and like graves whose outside looks like inhabited graves but whose inside is full of the bones of the dead.*

Matth. 23, 13 and 27

**6. Ih. I, 46, 14 inf.**

Jesus said: *How is he to be reckoned among the wise who, embarking on the way of the life to come, turns his footsteps to the life of this world. And how is he to be reckoned among the wise who seeks the word of God to announce it to others but doe not fulfil it himself.*

Lk. 9, 62 and 17, 32. Indirectly Matth. 23,3.

**7. Ih. I, 47, 7 inf.**

Jesus said: *Son of Mary, be warned. If you are warned, warn others. If you do not , then be ashamed before me.*

There are various readings of this passage in Asin's *apparatus criticus*, which I am unable to follow, so I have translated his Latin version. Perhaps an allusion to Lk. 4, 23.

**8. Ih. I, 48,15**

Jesus said: *The one who who acquires knowledge but does nothing with it is like a woman who is secretly impure. When she becomes heavy with child and her pregnancy become clear, she blushes with shame. So it is with the one who knows but does not do, God will humiliate him before the eyes of all on judgement day.*

No parallel in the Gospels.

**9. Ih. I, 48,15 inf.**

It is written in the Torah and the Gospels: *Do not seek to know what you do not know until you do what you do know.*

Untrustworthy (*verbum exigua dignum fide*).

**10. Ih. I, 217,15 inf.**

It is said that Jesus went forth to ask God for rain. When His disciples became annoyed,<sup>8</sup> Jesus said to them: *Let the one who has committed a sin return to his*

<sup>8</sup> Another reading proposed involves a slight change in the pointing of the first two letters and produces 'went into the

house. They all returned home, except one. Jesus said to him: *Do you have no sins ?* He said: *I know of no sin except that one day, while I was praying, a woman walked by and I looked at her with this eye. After she had gone, I put my finger into my eye, pulled it out and threw it after the woman.* Jesus said to him: *Pray to God that I may say Amen to your prayer.* The man prayed. The sky became dark with clouds and the rain fell and the drought dispersed.

There is no Gospel text to which this passage unambiguously refers, but the several possibilities include John 9, 13 and 8,7; Matt. , 28 and 18,9.

### **11. Ih. I, 222, 13.**

Speech of Jesus. He said: *God, I have become unable to ward off that which I abhor nor do I have the useful things I was hoping for. For the things are in the hand of another and I have become indebted in my work There is nobody poorer than me. Do not allow my enemy to rejoice over my misfortune or my friend to afflict me with sadness. Do not allow my misfortune in my religion or the care of this world to be the greatest of my cares. Do not subject me to the power of one who has no mercy on me. O Living One ! O Eternal One !*

A number of writers have commented on this saying, and opinions seem to be divided about whether it is to be attributed to Jesus. Asin points out that, despite the difference in content from Matt. 6, 9-13, there is a certain stylistic similarity to Matth. in the use of imperatives/prohibitions.

### **12. Ih. I, 243,3**

'Ali the son of Abû Tâlib said: *John son of Zachary, having filled himself with barley bread, slept through his prayer<sup>9</sup> until the next day. In a revelation God said to him: John, have you found for yourself a house better than My house or a neighbourhood better than mine ? By my power and majesty, John, if you ascended to Paradise, the fat of your body would disappear and your soul would leave your body. If you descended to Hell, the fat of your body would disappear and pus would flow after tears and you would out on a skin after anointing.*

An 'agraphon', but with a certain resemblance to Matt. 3,4.

---

desert'

<sup>9</sup> According to H. Wehr *Dictionary of Modern Arabic* (1961) p. 1060 this word (صَوْر) in Islam refers to a specified time for prayer apart from the usual times.

### **13. Ih. II, 56, 18**

[It is told] that Mary, while looking for Jesus, passed by some weavers, from whom she asked the way. They directed her to the wrong road, and she said: *'God, remove the blessing from their business and make their people poor and humiliate them in the eyes of the people.'* Her prayer was answered.

The story is from Mujâhid son of Jubair, an early 8th cent. writer. Though it seems as if it might be from an infancy gospel,<sup>10</sup> there is actually no evidence of it in this tradition.

### **14. Ih. II, 110, 15**

It is told that God revealed to Jesus: *If you served me with the service of those in heaven and on earth, and love of God and no hatred of God, this would be of no benefit to you.*

As it stands the final part of the protasis makes little sense, but this can be supplemented from a saying attributed to Abdallah son of Umar, a companion of Muhammad : ' ... *<and if in my heart there were no> love of <those who obey> God or hatred <for those who sin against> God.* 'The conclusion is that it is probably a reference to the passage in 1 Cor. 13, 1-3.

### **15. Ih. II, 110, 16**

Jesus said: *Make yourselves beloved of God by hating the disobedient and approach God by removing yourself from them and seek the approval of God by displeasing them.* They said: *Spirit of God, whose company do we keep ?* He replied: *Keep the company of those who remind you of the vision of God and who increase His word in your deeds and awaken a desire in you for the other life of His work.*

The only Gospel passage to which this might be a reference is Jo. 15, 18.

### **16. Ih. II, 124**

Jesus said to His disciples: *What do you do when you see your brother sleeping and the wind has blown away his tunic ?* They said: *We cover him.* He said: *Do*

---

<sup>10</sup> On the association of Mary with weaving see C.B. Lewis 'Origin of the weaving songs' *Proceedings of the Modern Language Association* 37 (1922): 141-181, especially 149ff. and M. Nutzmänn 'Mary in the Protevangelium of James' *Greek Roman and Byzantine Studies* 58 (2013): 551-578

*you uncover his nakedness ? They said: Praise be to God, who does such a thing ? He replied: One of you will hear a word against his brother, add to it and make it even more public.*

Probably a reference to Gen. 9, 20ff. Al Ghazâli adds a statement to this saying expressing the same sentiment as in Matt. 7, 12.

### **17. Ih. III, 23, 19**

It is said that devil appeared to Jesus son of Mary and said to him: *Tell me that there is no other Lord than God.* Jesus replied: *This is true, but I will not say it because you have said it. Deceit is also concealed in the good.*

Only in al Ghazâli. The most obvious NT passage is Matt. 4, 5-7.

### **18. Ih. III, 26, 4**

It is said that when Jesus son of Mary was born demons went to the devil and said to him: *Idols have appeared today lying on the ground with their heads removed.* The devil replied: *This is news indeed. Stay where you are.* He then flew to the far east and the far west, but found nothing. He then found that Jesus had and been born and was surrounded by angels. He went back to the demons and said to them: *A prophet was born yesterday. Nobody has ever been born of a woman or seen the light of day in my absence except for this prophet. Give up hope therefore that the idols are to be worshipped by men after this night. But tempt the sons of Adam by means of haste and levity.*

Asin unravels the elements of the story as follows:

1. the enfeeblement of the idols can be traced to the Infancy Gospel ( Fabricius *Codex Apocryphus* I, 175);
2. similarly the angels surrounding Jesus;
3. the devil's ignorance of the birth to Jerome's commentary on Matth. 1, 1, cf. also Fabricius I, 280 and the Ascension of Isaiah cc. 10 ad 11;
4. Muslim tradition that Jesus and Mary were the only ones ever born without being oppressed by Satan;
5. dialogue between devil and demons is found in the Gospel of Nicodemus (Fabricius I, 279).



**19. Ih. III, 48, 14**

It was said to Jesus: *Who educated You ?* He replied: *Nobody educated me. I saw the ignorance of the ignorant and avoided it.*

An agraphon. But Sayyid Murtadha al Zabidi (cited here as IT) says that this utterance was made by others.

**20. Ih. III, 48, 8 inf. (and elsewhere)**

Jesus said: *Blessed is the one who has abandoned present desire for an absent promise he has not seen.*

Clearly related to the Beatitudes in Matth. and Lk. Perhaps one should look to Jo. 12, 25: the word 'desire' (شهوة) is a synonym of 'soul' (نفس)=ψυχή, *appetitus scilicet concupiscibilis et irascibilis.*

**21. Ih. III, 60, 18 inf.**

Jesus said: *Apostles, make your bellies hungry and your bodies naked. In this way your hearts will perhaps see God.*

Predates al Ghazâli, who attributes it to Muhammad. Resemblance to the beatitudes 4 and 6 in Matt. 5, 6 and 8.

**22. Ih. III, 61, 6 inf.**

It is said that after Jesus had engaged in an intimate conversation with the Lord for sixty days, eating nothing, the thought of bread came suddenly to his attention and he discontinued the conversation. A small quantity of bread was then placed before him. He sat down, weeping over the loss of the conversation, when he saw an old man standing over him and Jesus said to him: *God bless you, friend of God and pray to God for me. While I was in an ecstatic condition, the thought of bread came to me and the condition of ecstasy was interrupted.* The old man replied: *My God, if you found that I had thought of bread after I had got to know you, you would not pardon me. But whenever I had something to eat here, I would eat it without thinking.*

Only in al Ghazâli. Jesus seems to be depicted as a hermit who has not yet reached perfection. Probably from an heretical or apocryphal text.

**23. Ih. III, 74,3 inf.**

Jesus said: *Keep yourselves from looking. For this generates carnal lust in the*

*heart and is enough for temptation.*

Cf. Matth. 5,28.

**24. Ih. III, 74,1 inf.**

It was said to John: *Where does depravity begin ?* He said: *Looking and longing.*

As above.

**25. Ih. III, 80,6 inf.**

It was said to Jesus: *Tell us what we need to be able to enter Paradise.* Jesus said: *Never speak.* The disciples replied: *We cannot do that.* Jesus said: *Therefore say nothing except what is good.*

Tradition in several Muslim mystics. It seems to be a variant of a common proverb (*triti proverbii tam apud Arabos quam alios*). The first part of the exchange seems to be an allusion to Jesus' silence when falsely accused. Asin cites two passages from Matth. 12, 36ff. and 19,16.

**26. Ih. III, 81, 4 (and elsewhere)**

Jesus said: *Worship has ten parts: nine of silence, one of avoiding people.*

The source of this as a saying of Jesus is not reliable, and the uncertainty becomes stronger when the same saying is found in another text, where it is attributed to another prophet. It is not in the NT.

**27. Ih. III, 85, 11 (and elsewhere)**

Jesus said: *He who lies is he whose whose beauty has gone; he who abuses servants is he whose chivalry is in decline; he who worries too much becomes physically ill; he whose character is bad punishes himself.*

Nothing in the NT, but ascriptions to various Muslim sources.

**28. Ih. III, 87, 6**

It is said that a pig passed by Jesus, who said to it: *Go in peace.* People said: *By the spirit of God, have you said this to a pig ?* And he said: *I find it odious to accustom my tongue to shameful words.*

Attested in the 8th cent. Parallels in Matth. 5, 22 and Mk. 5, 11-14

### **29. Ih. III, 100, 9**

Mâlik ibn Dînâr said: Jesus and his disciples passed by the corpse of a dog. His disciples said: *How repellent the smell of this dog is !* Jesus said: *How white his teeth are !*

8th cent. Al Ghazâli understands this to mean that nothing bad should be said any creature.

### **30. Ih. III, 114, 16 (and elsewhere)**

John said to Jesus: *Do not be angry.* Jesus said: *I cannot help being angry. For I am human.* John replied: *Do not acquire wealth.* Jesus said: *That can be done.*

As one might expect there is nothing of the sort in the NT. There is a possible reference to Jesus' anger in Matt. 21,12, where he drives the moneychangers from the Temple. Asin thinks that the emphasis on the humanity of Jesus may come from apocryphal gospels.

### **31. Ih. III, 119,7**

John said to Jesus: *What is the most dreadful thing ?* Jesus replied: *The anger of God.* John said: *What comes close<sup>11</sup> to the anger of God ?* Jesus: *If you are angry.*

John: *What starts the anger and what makes it grow ?* Jesus: *Pride, boasting, arrogance and a hot temper.*

Sayyid Murtadha counsels that this saying is to be attributed to Muhammad. The nearest NT passage is probably Matth. 5,22.

### **32. Ih. III, 123, 19**

The Messiah son of Mary passed by a crowd of Jews, who began to abuse him. But he blessed them. It was said to him: *They abuse you, and you bless them !* He said: *Everyone sells what he has.*

Attested in Muslim sources, but parallels with Matth. 12, 34ff. and Lk. 6, 28 and 45. Sayyid Murtadha locates in this saying the origin of the Arab proverb to the effect that everything loses what is in it, one way or another.

### **33. Ih. III, 127. 13 (and elsewhere)**

It is said that it is written in the Gospel: *He who forgives the one who oppresses him, he has triumphed over the devil.*

---

<sup>11</sup> Asin takes the verb to be transitive and supplies an object: *What brings me close to the anger of God.* In another version of the text, the exchange is as follows: *What keeps one far from the anger of God ?* He said: *Do not be angry.*

There is said to be a book about forgiveness of injuries. The Gospel passage is Lk. 6, 28.

### **34. Ih. III, 139, 11 inf.**

Jesus said: *Do not take the world for your lord, for it will take you as its servant. Store your treasure with that which will not crumble. The one who possesses the treasure of this world fears loss. But the one who possesses the treasure of God does not fear loss.*

Jesus also said: *Disciples, I have flattened the world for you. Do not revive it after me. For the wickedness of the world is such that the enemies of God are in it and that life hereafter cannot be achieved unless you abandon it. You are travellers through it, not residents. Know that the root of all sin is love of the world and the pleasure of an hour causes people long-term grief.*

He also said: *I have flattened this world for you that you may sit upon it. Neither kings nor women will move you with temptations. As far as kings are concerned, do not struggle with them because of the world. They will not oppose you provided you leave them and their wealth alone. As for women, keep yourselves from them with prayer and fasting.*

He also said: *This life is asking and being asked. The one who asks for the next life is asked by this life to achieve what he needs to live. The one who asks for this life is asked by the next life to die and be taken by the neck.*

Als attributed to Muhammad. Asin detects various NT sources:

Matth. 6, 19ff

Joh. 16, 33

Matth. 6,24

Matth. 17, 20;

2 Cor. 4,17 and the OT

Eccl. 10, 15

Notwithstanding the similarities (*His tamen analogiis non obstantibus*) Asin thinks that the whole passage is an agraphon.

### **35. Ih. III, 140, 10 (and elsewhere)**

Jesus said: *The love of this world and the next cannot coexist in the heart of the faithful any more than water and fire in one vessel.*

Probably a reference (*imaginibus mutandis*) to Matt. 6 ,24.

### **36. Ih. III, 140, 7 inf.**

It was said to Jesus: *If you were to take a house that protects you ... ?* He said: *The creations that were before us are enough for us.*

Unwritten testimony but undoubtedly (*proculdubio*) a reference to Matt. 8, 20, though oral testimony (*quamvis agraphon*). The opening question sounds somewhat strange, and I wonder it corresponds to the repetition of a previous unanswered form of the question. German is able to do this, as in the following exchange: 'Kannst du das mitnehmen (Can you take that with you ?)' (Direct) - no reply - 'Ob du das mitnehmen' kannst.' (Indirect).

### **37. Ih. III, 141, 1**

It is told that Jesus, annoyed by the rain, thunder and lightning one day, began to look for some place to take refuge. He saw a tent in the distance and went towards it. But in it there was a woman, and he went away from it. He then saw a cave in the rock face. He went towards and found that there was a lion in it, and He put his hand on it and said: *My God, You have made for everything a refuge, but You have not made a refuge for me.* Then God revealed to him: *Your refuge is in the settlement of My mercy. On the day of judgement I will give you a hundred beautiful girls in matrimony, whom I have formed with My hand, and I will set you firmly on your throne with enough to eat for 4,000 years, each day of which will like the life of this world and, at length, I will order a herald to announce: Where are the devout who abstain from the things of this world ? Come and attend out of respect the throne of the one who truly abstained, Jesus the son of Mary.*

Not attested anywhere as such in the N.T., but the elements are Matt. 8,20 and 19,29 and Lk. 22, 29ff. The final section seems to contain debased apocryphal material of millenarianist tendency. A commentary of Jerome on Matt. 19 is cited: *ut qui unam mulierem pro Domini dimiserit centum recipiat in futuro.*

### **38. Ih. III, 141, 5**

Jesus son of Mary said: *Woe to the person of the world ! How will he die and leave it and what is in it ? It has deceived him and his deeply rooted faith in it. Woe to*

*those deceived ! How what they hate will obliterate them and what they love leave them and what threaten them come upon them ! Woe to the man whose care is the world and whose deeds are sinful ! How ashamed he will be tomorrow for his sin !*

The only NT passage detectable here is Lk. 6, 24ff.

### **39. Ih. III, 141, 17**

'Umar ibn Sa'id said: *Jesus passed through a village, where the inhabitants lay dead in courtyards and on the roads. Jesus said: Apostles, these have been destroyed by the anger of God. If they had died in any other way, they would have buried each other. They said: Spirit of God, we wish to learn the history of these people. Jesus asked God and God revealed the following: When night comes, call them to you and they will answer you. So when night came, Jesus went up on to high ground and called to the people. One of them replied: I am here, Spirit of God. Jesus then asked: What state are you in and how did it happen ? He replied: We went to sleep healthy and on the following day we seemed to be in hell. Jesus said: How did it happen ? He replied: Because we loved the world and listened to sinners. Jesus replied: What was your love of the world like ? He replied: It was like that of a child for its mother. While the world accepted us with kindness, we were happy. But when it turned it back on us, we became sad and wept for it. Jesus said: Why did you neighbours not answer me ? He replied: They are lying in fiery chains at the hands of angels which are savage and inhuman. Jesus then asked him why he had replied. Because I lived among them but was not of them. So when the punishment of God visited them, it did not touch men. And here I am, hanging over the abyss of Gehenna, not knowing if I am to be released from it or to be cast headlong into it. The Messiah then said to the apostles: Eat barley bread with crushed salt, put on a goat hair cloak and sleep in a place with much refuse for well-being in this and the next life.*

The identity of 'Umar ibn Sa'id is not known. The story is also transmitted by Wahab ibn Munabbih, a 7th cent. Jewish convert to Islam, a principal difference being that the latter story seems to contain a being called al Hawiya, described as a 'prisoner'.

**40. Ih. III, 141, 11 inf.**

Jesus said: *Who builds a house on the sand of the sea ? For you have the world. Do not take it as fixed.*

Matth. 7, 26

**41. Ih. III, 141, 10 inf.**

It was said to Jesus: *Tell us us one reason why God will love us.* Jesus replied: *Reject the world. God will love you.*

Jo. 12, 25 and 15, 18ff.

**42. Ih. III, 142, 9**

Jesus said: *Apostles, be satisfied with a modest amount of the world and the welfare of religion just as the people of the world are satisfied with a modest amount of religion and the welfare of the world.*

Matth. 10, 39 and 14, 24ff.

**43. Ih. III, 228, 12 inf.**

Christ said: *You who seek the world that you may benefit it, leave it that you might be more pious.* He also said: *The worst thing is that his prosperity occupies him at the expense of attention to God, which is the greatest and most noble occupation.*

An agraphon, but clearly expresses the same sentiment of the opposition between wealth and poverty in the Gospels.

**44. Ih. III, 146, 12 inf.**

If you wish, imitate the spirit and the word of Jesus son of Mary, for He used to say: *My additional food is hunger; my feeling fear; my clothing wool; my cloak in winter the rising sun; my light the moon; my beast of burden my legs; my food the fruit produced by the earth. I have nothing when I go to sleep. I have nothing when I wake up. And there is no-one on earth richer than me.*

Said to be found also in a text by a 10th cent. writer, al Sharif al Murtadha Abu'l Qâsim 'Ali. It is an

agraphon, but has elements that can be found in the Gospels.

**45. Ih. III, 148, 15 inf.**

It is told that the world was revealed to Jesus and he saw it as a toothless old woman covered with many ornaments and he said to her: *How many men have you been married to ?* And she said: *I cannot count them.* Jesus said: *Did they all die on you or did they divorce you ?* She said: *No, I killed them all.* Jesus said: *Woe to those who have survived you. How did they not consider your former husbands, how you killed one after the other, and not be on their guard against you ?*

This story is attested earlier than al Ghazali, albeit in another version, as a story told by Muhammad. The Christian text to which it seems to be related is Jo. 4, 16ff.

**46. Ih. III, 149, 11 (and elsewhere)**

Jesus said: *This world is a bridge. Pass through it, but do not build your homes in it.*

A tradition associated with Muhammad but attributed to Jesus. According to Bernhard Pick *Remains of Gospels and sayings of Christ* (1908) p. 107 the saying is written on a wall in the mosque of Sikri (Agra, India).

**47. Ih. III, 149, 14 inf.**

Jesus said: *In truth, I say to you : As the weak person looks at food but is not pleased by it because of the severe pain, so also the lover of the world is not pleased by devotion and does not find its sweetness, whatever he may find of the love of this world. In truth, the animal that it is not ridden or trained is difficult and of a changeable temperament, so also hearts that are softened by the thought of death and the discipline of devotion are hard and obdurate. In truth, I say to you that as each person who is not torn to pieces or burned almost becomes a vessel for honey, so also the hearts of men not corrupted by desires or greed or the blandishments of life become vessels for wisdom.*

This saying is very similar to one attributed to an 8th cent. Muslim, where the comparison is made between a weak body and a weak soul. It is an agraphon, albeit evangelical in style.



**48. Ih. III, 149, 5 inf.**

Jesus said: *He who seeks the world is like a man who drinks the water of the sea: the more he drinks the thirstier he becomes, until the water kills him.*

Occurs only in al Ghazâli. An agraphon. Cites J.A. Fabricius *Codex Apocryphus* III, 394

**49. Ih. III, 161, 14 inf.**

The apostles said to Jesus: *Why is that you walk on water and we cannot ?* He said: *What is the status of the denarius and drachma with you ?* They said: *Good.* He said: *To me they are both mud.*

Seems to combine two NT passages: Matt. 14, 25ff. and Phil. 3, 8

**50. Ih. III, 164, 17 inf.**

Jesus said: *There are three things wrong with money: it is acquired illicitly.* They said: *If it is acquired legitimately ?* He said: *He will put it in things not allowed..* They said: *If he puts it in things allowed ?* He replied: *The care of it will distract him from God on high.*

Recorded by Sayyid Murtadha, who unusually makes no attempt to explain it. No comparable Biblical passage. Asin refers to nos. 43 and 73.